Appendix A Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

Section 65588(a) of the Government Code requires that jurisdictions evaluate the effectiveness of the existing Housing Element, the appropriateness of goals, objectives and policies, and the progress in implementing programs for the previous planning period. This appendix contains a review of the housing goals, policies and programs of the previous housing element and evaluates the degree to which these programs have been implemented during the previous planning period. The findings from this evaluation have been instrumental in determining the City's 2023-2031 Housing Plan.

Table A-1 summarizes the programs contained in the previous Housing Element along with the City's accomplishments and actual results compared to the objectives projected or planned. The evaluation of any differences between what was planned versus achieved has been instrumental in preparing updated objectives and programs in the 2023 Housing Element.

Table A-2 presents the City's progress in meeting the quantified objectives from the previous Housing Element. The City's objectives for new construction was 163 total units, of which 65 were lower-income units consistent with the 5th cycle RHNA allocation. The City exceeded its total objective by 13% (184 actual units), and the 45 lower-income units approved represents over 69% of the objective, a significant achievement given that available housing subsidies fall far short of the need. Nevertheless, programs have been updated and revised based on the experience gained during the 5th cycle. For example, Program 1 has been added to ensure adequate sites are available to meet the 6th cycle RHNA allocation and development standards do not act as impediments to achieving allowable densities. Program 2 has been updated to expand the ADU program and include monitoring throughout the planning period so that adjustments can be made as necessary if anticipated production levels are not being met. Program 11 has been updated to ensure compliance with state law for special needs housing and Program 17 identifies specific meaningful actions the City will take, in addition to combatting discrimination, to overcome patterns of segregation and foster inclusive communities during the planning period.

Effectiveness in meeting low-income housing needs

The City has made significant progress during the previous planning period addressing the housing needs of lower-income households. Recent accomplishments include the following:

- Approval of new affordable housing. The City facilitated the approval and development of Casas de las Flores, which included 43 lower-income apartments, developed and managed by People's Self-Help Housing Corporation. The City continues to work with non-profit affordable housing developers to facilitate the construction and long-term affordability of lower-income housing in the City.
- <u>ADU ordinance</u>. The city adopted new regulations in 2022 to encourage development of ADUs. The Coastal Commission certified these amendments to the local coastal plan in late 2022 and the ordinance became effective February 22, 2023. Additional actions the City will take to encourage and facilitate ADU production and ensure objectives are met during the current planning period are described in Program 2 (Accessory Dwelling Units) of the Housing Plan.

Revised Draft A-1 November 2023

Mobile home preservation. Mobile homes represent approximately 14% of the City's housing stock. The City's Mobile Home Park Closure Ordinance, Mobile Home Rent Stabilization Program, and Mobile Home Rent Stabilization Disclosure Ordinance have ensured that many of these units remain affordable to lower-income households. The City will continue to implement these regulations through Program 12 (Conservation of Mobile Home Parks and Rent Stabilization).

Effectiveness in meeting special housing needs

Special housing needs populations include the elderly, persons with disabilities or chronic illnesses, farmworkers, and people experiencing homelessness. Some of the ways the housing needs of special needs populations were addressed during the prior planning period include:

- <u>Safe Parking Program</u>. On October 24, 2022, the Carpinteria City Council contracted with New Beginnings Counseling Center to provide the Safe Parking Program in the City of Carpinteria for persons experiencing homelessness. The program is currently in the development stage.
- Homeless Navigation Services. A weekly lunch program managed by Home for Good is
 offered in the City as a means to gather local homeless persons to one area on a specific
 day and time where services are offered. As of 2022, the lunch program offers services
 from a County Drug and Alcohol Specialist, County Behavior Wellness, CityNet (the regional
 homeless services entity), New Beginnings, local business and entities, and community
 volunteers provide weekly lunches and provisions.
- <u>Permanent Housing for Homeless Individuals</u>. During 2021-2022 approximately 45 people experiencing homelessness in Carpinteria received assistance, including six people who were placed in permanent housing.
- Accessible and Family Units. The Casas de las Flores development includes three units
 with accessibility features that are available to lower-income households. In addition, seven
 one-bedroom, 14 two-bedroom, 12 three-bedroom flats and 10 three-bedroom townhomes
 are included in the development, along with a playground, walking paths, and laundry
 facilities to serve larger families.
- Housing for the Elderly. The Steadfast GranVida project approved in 2015 is a licensed Residential Care Facility for the Elderly (RCFE). The facility is licensed by the California Department of Social Services and includes 70 units with 76 beds. Phase 2 of this successful development is approved for an additional 50 residential units on a 1.8-acre commercial parcel at 5464 Carpinteria Avenue.
- <u>Services for the Elderly.</u> The City Council in 2022 established an Ad Hoc Senior Services
 Planning Committee which conducted a Community Needs Assessment to derive datadriven recommendations for the creation of a senior services program. Among other things,
 the committee will assess senior housing needs. The committee is currently exploring
 potential interim and long-term service models and partnerships.

Revised Draft A-2 November 2023

Table A-1 Housing Element Program Evaluation 2015-2022

Program	Objective	Timeframe	Status of Program Implementation				
1. Second Units	14 second units	Ongoing	Major changes to State ADU law were adopted by the Legislature in recent years and in 2022 the City amended the Zoning Ordinance to incorporate current State law. A total of 3 second units were permitted during the planning period under the prior Zoning Code. The new ADU Ordinance and st continues to promote ADUs consistent with State law. This program is successful and should be continued through implementation of the City's ADU Ordinance and programs to encourage ADU construction.				
2. Energy Conservation	Reduce residential energy use throughout the planning period	Ongoing	The Building Division and Community Development Department continued to promote energy efficient and energy saving opportunities on new and redevelopment projects. This program is successful and should be continued.				
3. No Net Loss	Ensure compliance with no net loss requirements throughout the planning period	Ongoing	The Community Development Department continued to ensure compliance with no net loss of residential units through the review of development permits. This program is successful and she be continued.				
4. Section 8 Rental Assistance	169 Units for Lower Income Households	Ongoing	The City continues to work with the County of Santa Barbara Housing Authority which adminis the Section 8 Program. Currently there are 177 Section 8 vouchers issued by the Housing Aut of Santa Barbara County and the City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority within the City of Carpinteria. This program is successful and should be continued.				
5. Affordable Rental Housing	43 lower income rental units during the planning period	2015-2023	During the planning period the City assisted in the development of Casas de las Flores, which includes 42 affordable rental apartments in the low- and very-low-income range and one manager's unit. This program is successful and should be continued with additional actions to support the construction of lower income rental units.				
6. Inclusionary Housing	10 Inclusionary Housing Units during the planning period	2015-2023	Staff continued to identify opportunities for additional inclusionary housing and work with developers on multi-family housing. Two projects, Green Heron Spring and Faith Lutheran Church Subdivision/The Cottages Residences, provided a total of five inclusionary units within this Housing Element cycle. Although the City successfully implemented the Inclusionary Housing ordinance, the City had limited interest in private for-sale developments with five or more units during the planning period. This program is successful and should be continued with additional incentives necessary to promote more affordable inclusionary units.				
7. Density Bonus	Continue to offer density bonus incentives throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The Casas de las Flores project included 43 lower-income apartment units and relied on Density Bonus incentives to facilitate development. The City continues to provide density bonus incentive information to qualifying developments through the planning and development review process. This program is successful and should be continued.				
8. Facilitate Lot Consolidation	Continue to facilitate consolidation of small lots during the planning period	2015-2023	The City continues to discuss lot consolidation with developers on a project-by-project basis. Lot consolidation is encouraged to allow higher densities and where appropriate offer incentives, flexibility and expedited permit processing. Development during the planning period, however, generally did not require small lot consolidation for construction. This program is successful and should be continued.				

Revised Draft A-3 November 2023

Program	Objective	Timeframe	Status of Program Implementation
Regulatory Concessions and Incentives	Facilitate construction of affordable units commensurate with the City's needs throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The Community Development Department continued to provide information to developers regarding concessions and incentives available for affordable rental -ownership projects. The City achieved more than its objective of affordable units during the planning period. This program is successful and should be continued.
10. Fee Mitigation	Facilitate construction of affordable units commensurate with the City's needs throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The Community Development Department held discussions regarding both affordable rental units and affordable ownership condominiums. In 2017, the city lowered Development Impact Fees for Secondary Dwelling Units to facilitate the permitting of such units. The new 2022 ADU Ordinance adopts state law to reduce or eliminate Development Impact Fees altogether. This program is successful and should be continued with additional fee deferral programs.
11. Special Needs Housing	Continue to implement zoning regulations that facilitate construction of housing for persons with special needs through the planning period	2015-2023	Three of the units in the Casas de las Flores development for lower-income households included accessibility features. The City provides services to people experiencing homelessness via collaboration with the County of Santa Barbara, non-government organizations providing homeless services in the region, and local community-based volunteers and organizations. During 2021-2022 approximately 45 people experiencing homelessness in Carpinteria received assistance, including six people who were placed in permanent housing. The City also facilitated approval of a 50-unit assisted living development at 138% of maximum density. One building permit for a Secondary Dwelling Unit was issued in 2021 with a reasonable accommodation request. This program is successful and should be continued with additional programs to support special needs populations.
12. Conservation of Mobile Home Parks	Facilitate preservation of 7 mobile home parks and moderate rental rates throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The City has continued to monitor rental rates in mobile home parks through the Mobile Home Rent Stabilization Program and has had no conversion of the 7 mobile home parks in Carpinteria. This program is successful and should be continued.
13. Condominium Conversion Ordinance	Facilitate preservation of existing units throughout the planning period	2015-2023	No residential rental units were converted to condominiums due to provisions of the Condominium Conversion Ordinance related to rental vacancy rates. This program is successful and should be continued.
14. Inspection on Sale	Facilitate preservation of existing housing units throughout the planning period	2015-2023	This program has been discontinued. This program was discontinued after a lawsuit was filed challenging a similar program in the City of Santa Barbara and other successful lawsuits challenging similar requirements nationwide. The City also found no evidence that the program encouraged additional housing production or preserved existing housing units.
15. Rental Housing Inspection	Facilitate preservation of existing single-family rental housing units throughout the planning period	2015-2023	This program has been discontinued. This program was discontinued after a lawsuit was filed challenging a similar program in the City of Santa Barbara and other successful lawsuits challenging similar requirements nationwide. The City also found no evidence that the program encouraged additional housing production or preserved existing single-family rental housing units.
16. Housing Code Compliance	Facilitate preservation of existing single-family rental housing units throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The Community Development Department's Building and Code Compliance divisions conducted site inspections and enforced the housing and building and safety codes through compliance orders and administrative citations. This program is successful and should be continued.

Program	Objective	Timeframe	Status of Program Implementation
17. Single Family Housing Rehabilitation	Rehabilitation of 2 units occupied by extremely-low income owner households and 3 units occupied by very-low income owner households during the planning period	2015-2023	The City continued to encourage eligible very-low income homeowners to contact the USDA Rural Housing Repair and Rehabilitation Program for loans to help modernize and improve their homes to remove health and safety hazards. Although the City does not have information regarding successful rehabilitation of units during the planning period, this program has the potential to be successful and should be continued with additional outreach efforts to USDA and interested homeowners.
18. Multi-family Rehabilitation	Rehabilitation of 2 extremely-low income units, 1 very-low income unit, and 6 low income units during the planning period	2015-2023	The City continued to seek grant funds and assist in the rehabilitation of multifamily housing in need of repair. Lack of funding and public information about the program likely hindered its success. This program has the potential to be successful and should be continued with additional outreach efforts to grant providers and interested parties.
19. Fair Housing Information and Referral	Continue to disseminate fair housing information to residents, landlords, and other interested parties throughout the planning period; conduct annual fair housing workshops in cooperation with the Rental Housing Mediation Program	2015-2023	The City continued to partner with the City of Santa Barbara's Rental Housing Mediation Program to provide tenants, landlords, and interested parties with information and mediation services related to housing and rental disputes. The City also referred residents to the Legal Aid Foundation of Santa Barbara County and California Rural Legal Assistance to address concerns related to disability access, those living on fixed incomes, and victims of domestic or elder abuse. This program is successful and should be continued.
20. Workforce Homebuyer Down Payment Loans	Continue to facilitate home ownership for local workforce throughout the planning period	2015-2023	The City continued to provide down payment loans, in collaboration with the Housing Trust Fund of Santa Barbara County. 10 loans were funded during the planning period. This program is successful and should be continued.

Revised Draft A-5 November 2023

Table A-2
Progress in Achieving Quantified Objectives 2015-2022

	New Construction		Rehabilitation		Conservation				
Income Category	Objective	Actual	Objective	Actual	Obje	Objective		Actual	
Extremely-Low	20		2	na	169¹	8602	177	860	
Very-Low	19	33	1						
Low	26	12	6		-				
Moderate	34	2	-	-	-		-		
Above-Moderate	64	137	-	-	-		-		
Total	163	184	9	na	-		-		

^{1.} Section 8 units

^{2.} Mobile homes